Dear Professor Aydogdu,

I have gone through your paper entitled "The momentum 4-vector in bulk viscous Bianchi type-V space-time" by Oktay Aydogdu and Mustafa Salti (Czech. J. Phys., Vol. 56 No. 8 (2006), 789-798 which is attached with your mail.

I declare that the object of your paper is quite different that of my paper (gr-qc/0611031). Definately, you have not plagiarized my paper.

Regards,
Sincerely
A. Pradhan

---

Dear Dr. Oktay Aydogdu,

really this action is very stranger and i heard about this kind of action for the first time. In my paper I introduced the Landau-Lifshitz, Einstein and Bergman-Thompson pseudotensor to teleparallel gravity and only consider the energy of the closed universe in this framework. In your papers you consider the energy momentum for Bianchi type V and topological BH, so these are not plagiarism.

Only one comment:i am not professor, only postdoc.
Best regards,
T Vargas.

---

Dear Dr Aydogdu

I have no knowledge of the events leading to the withdrawal of your papers, although I did notice the withdrawal.

I have looked at your paper, as attached to your email, and I looked again at my paper.
I have not made a careful study of your paper, but have only looked at the issue of its relation to my paper. **There is no plagiarism of my paper that I can detect, and I cannot see any direct relation between the topics of my paper and yours.**

Sincerely, Roy Maartens,

-0-

Date: Tue, 31 Jul 2007 11:49:30 -0700 (PDT)
From: "Irina Radinschi" <radinschi@yahoo.com>
Subject: papers
To: musts6@yahoo.com

Dear Professors,

I write to you concerning the removing of the paper The Momentum 4-vector imparted by gravitational waves in Bianchi-type metrics’ by Ali Havare, Murat Korunur (Mersin U.), Mustafa Salti (Middle East Tech. U., Ankara). **I do not consider that the authors plagiare my paper.**

I wish you all the best!
Sincerely Yours,
Irina Radinschi

-0-

Date: Thu, 6 Sep 2007 11:38:40 -0700 (PDT)
From: "Irina Radinschi" <radinschi@yahoo.com>
Subject: plagiarism
To: oktay231@yahoo.com

Dear Dr. Aydogdu,

Apart from generalities, I could not find any of the alleged plagiarism concerning the essential part of my papers. **Further, my works are cited in yours papers, so I do not find any problem.**

Sincerely Yours,
Irina Radinschi
Dear Dr. Oktay Aydogdu,

Sorry for the delay, but **a first glance of your work tell me that you did not plagiarize my work.**

Best regards,
Sergio del Campo

---

I have written and published five (5) papers on pseudotensors. However, I haven't done any work on braneworlds and teleparallel gravity. I really do not understand how you could plagiarize my papers since we are working in the same research field **BUT on DIFFERENT problems.**

**Therefore, you have NOT plagiarized any of my papers.**

Sincerely Yours, Elias C. Vagenas

---

Apart from generalities, **I could not find any of the alleged plagiarism** concerning the essential part of my work. **Besides, my work is cited by you, so I do not find any problem.**

Sincerely, Th. Grammenos